

写在前面

如果从规模和硬件上说,文化艺术的发展正在从宏观政策扎根到具体实践上,甚至说超过了政策的设计和预期,呈现蓬勃繁茂的态势,但是在提质增效或者说高质量发展上,却面临着一系列普遍性的难题与困境,而对实践的反思与开拓自然离不开理论的支撑与引领。包括大剧院、美术馆在内的艺术机构以及文化企业是艺术生产的载体,也是艺术管理的逻辑起点,更是艺术学理论这个一级学科新的研究面向。也就是说,对艺术组织、艺术市场、艺术管理的研究正在改变其长期不受重视的地位而由学术边缘走向研究中心,所以我们看到这个领域的学术交流与讨论多了起来,研究与著作也多了起来,在经验性、实操类问题与社会性、学理类问题等诸多方面涌现了一大批学术成果,取得了一系列理论突破。

年轻的艺术管理学科呼唤研究的新范式。如何界定并解释艺术管理研究的论域与方法,如何有针对性地在艺术管理研究中使用问卷调查、田野考察、案例分析、深度访谈以及量化研究、质性研究等常用方法,如何运用文化经济、文化政策、公共管理等学科理论作为艺术管理研究的分析工具,如何强调研究在艺术行业发展中的适用性和应用价值,这既是学科发展的基本需求,也是本期选编文稿的实际遵循,相信读者会从不同栏目的20多篇论文中体会到这一点。本期还特别约请刘筠梅、方华、赵乐、方军等老师结合各自专长对相关论文进行审校,就选题、论证及结构提出了不少修改意见,使修改后的论文增色不少。

艺术管理

A R T S
MANAGEMENT

中国知网全文收录期刊
全国艺术学类核心期刊

主管单位 上海世纪出版集团
主办单位 上海戏剧学院 上海人民美术出版社
出版单位 《艺术管理》编辑部

学术委员会主任 陈 平

学术委员会委员 (按姓氏笔画排名)

马述智 于建刚 尹 丹 田川流 孙洪斌 朱恪孝 余 丁 吴曼芳
吴杨波 吴爱丽 张蓓荔 张朝霞 张 捷 杨 波 林宏鸣 罗宏才
郑新文 郑 洁 林 一 单 增 赵 乐 黄昌勇 董 峰 葛丽英

[比] Annick Schramme [美] Constance Devereaux

[俄] Ekaterina Shekova [加] Francois Colbert [澳] Kate Macneill

[美] Sheburne Laughlin [美] Travis Newton [英] Victoria Alexander

主 编 黄昌勇

副 主 编 顾 伟

国 际 主 编 [加] Francois Colbert

国际副主编 郑 洁 林 一 [美] Constance Devereaux

执 行 主 编 董 峰

编辑部主任 管 理 孙 青

英 文 编 辑 黄 海

中 文 编 辑 张乃雍

整 体 设 计 同济大学设计艺术研究中心

编辑部地址 上海市华山路 630 号仞之楼 206 室

邮政编码 200040

电子邮箱 yshgl@outlook.com

出版日期 2019 年 9 月 15 日

印 刷 上海长鹰印刷厂

发行范围 公开

国际标准连续出版物号 ISSN2096-6423

国内统一连续出版物号 CN31-2155/J

定 价 ¥38.00 元

艺术管理研究方法专题

- 005 案例研究法在国内剧院团管理研究中的应用及范式建构 / 刘筠梅
012 混合研究法在剧院管理研究中的应用——以上海音乐厅为例 / 袁晓露, 张国良, 杨子, 邵欣悦
016 论数字经济时代文艺院团管理研究视角与思路 / 王相华

学科建设与专业发展

- 022 重新思考艺术管理学科范式 / 黄海
027 美术博物馆学的学科体系建构 / 吴晓欧, 刘诗源
031 当前国有文艺院团表演艺术人才培养与建设研究
——基于18家国有文艺院团的调查分析 / 陈庚, 唐培
040 美国艺术管理专业课程体系的构建与标准 / 马董
048 文化经济视角下大运河文化带期刊研究全景分析 / 陈颖, 唐雯琦

访谈与对话

- 060 抒写中国写意精神, 塑造国际创新形象
——中国美术馆研究部负责人邵晓峰教授访谈 / 赵澄, 王易凡

历史、理论与方法

- 066 试析新时代文化建设语境下艺术管理的发展路径 / 秦璇, 李秋萍
072 文化企业可持续孵化机制研究——来自成都市文化企业孵化器的调查与分析 / 马健
080 线上模式影响下的艺术机制与艺术创作 / 杨西
086 “社会参与”艺术在中国台湾地区的发展脉络 / 吕佩怡
100 创意阶层数字叙事风格研究 / 周育红
108 公共预算中的教育干预和戏剧诗学的贡献
/[巴西]多迪·塔瓦列斯·李尔, [巴西]小埃德加·布鲁诺·科纳钦恩, [巴西]西尔维亚·佩雷拉·德卡斯特罗·卡萨诺瓦
122 从艺术产业视角评估香港巴塞爾艺术展 / 彭咏淇

艺术机构运营、管理与发展

- 134 博物馆连锁体系的形成机制与运营形态 / 窦宇
139 演出机构经营性票价制定策略分析 / 蒋雅如
148 从自发自洽到创意系统——大理白族戏曲艺术表演团体研究 / 杨洪吕
154 艺术营销中的客户关系: 艺术文化机构的关键维度述评
/[加]弗朗索瓦·科尔伯特, [法]丹尼洛·丹塔斯

动态·综述·书评

- 167 文化产业与艺术管理专业的教学与人才培养的机遇及挑战
——教育部高等学校艺术学理论类专业教学指导委员会第二次工作会议纪要 / 宗祖盼
171 回应·链接·创新——“2019清华美院艺术管理论坛”综述 / 章锐, 刘莹

Special Topic on Research Methods of Art Management

- 005 Application and Paradigm Construction of Case Study Method in Research of the Management of Chinese Theatres and Troupes / Liu Yunmei
- 012 Application of Mixed Research Methods in the Research of Theater Management
— Shanghai Concert Hall as Case / Yuan Xiaolu, Zhang Guoliang, Yang Zi, Shao Xinyue
- 016 On the Research Perspective and Thought of the Management of Art Theatres and Troupes in the Era of Digital Economy / Wang Xianghua

Discipline Construction and Professional Development

- 022 Rethinking the Paradigm of the Discipline of Arts Management / Huang Hai
- 027 Research on the Construction of the Discipline System of Art Museology / Wu Xiaou, Liu Shiyuan
- 031 Research on the Cultivation and Construction of Performing Arts Talents in the State-owned Performing Art Troupes in China: Based on the Investigation of 18 State-owned Troupes / Chen Geng, Tang Pei
- 040 The Construction and Standard of the Curriculum System of American Art Management Specialty / Ma Xuan
- 048 Panoramic Analysis of Journal Research on Grand Canal Culture Belt from the Perspective of Cultural Economy / Chen Ying, Tang Wenqi

Interview and Dialogue

- 060 Expressing Chinese Freehand Brushwork Spirit and Creating International Innovative Image
— Interview with Professor Shao Xiaofeng, Head of Research Department of China Art Museum / Zhao Cheng, Wang Yifan

History, Theory and Methods

- 066 Analysis of the Development Path of Art Management in the Context of Cultural Construction in the New Era / Qin Xuan, Li Qiuping
- 072 Sustainable Incubation Mechanism of Cultural Enterprises: Investigation and Analysis of Cultural Business Incubators in Chengdu / Ma Jian
- 080 Artistic Mechanism and Artistic Creation under the Influence of Online Model / Yang Xi
- 086 Study on Social Engagement Art in Taiwan / Lu Peiyi
- 100 Research on Digital Narrating Styles of Creative Class / Zhou Yuhong
- 108 Pedagogic Interventions in Public Budgeting and Contributions of Theatrical Poetics
/ [Brazil] Dodi Tavares Borges Leal, [Brazil] Edgard Bruno Cornachione Junior, [Brazil] Silvia Pereira de Castro Casa Nova
- 122 Assessing the Impact of Art Basel in Hong Kong: An Arts Industry Perspective / PANG Wing Ki, Vanessa

Operation, Management and Development of Art Institutions

- 134 The Formation Mechanism and Operation Form of Museum Chain System / Dou Yu
- 139 Analysis of the Performing Arts Market Operation and Ticket Pricing Mechanism / Jiang Yaru
- 148 From Spontaneity and Self-Consistency to Creative System
— Research on Dali Bai Opera Art Performance Group / Yang Honglu
- 154 Customer Relationships in Arts Marketing: A Review of Key Dimensions in Delivery by Artistic and Cultural Organizations / [Canada] François Colbert, [France] Danilo C. Dantas

Dynamics, Review and Book Review

- 167 Cultural Industry and Art Management Teaching and Training: Opportunities and Challenges
— Summary of the Second Working Meeting of the Teaching Steering Committee of Art Theory Specialty of Higher Education Institutions of the Ministry of Education / Zong Zupan
- 171 Response, Link and Innovation: Summary of “2019 Art Management Forum of Academy of Arts & Design, Tsinghua University” / Zhang Rui, Liu Ying

Pedagogic interventions in public budgeting and contributions of theatrical poetics

[Brazil]Dodi Tavares Borges Leal, [Brazil]Edgard Bruno Cornachione Junior,
[Brazil]Silvia Pereira de Castro Casa Nova

Federal University of South Bahia (Brazil), University of Sao Paulo (USP) , Universidade de São Paulo

Author: Dodi Tavares Borges Leal, PhD. is Full Professor of Theatre at Federal University of South Bahia (Brazil). PhD in Social Psychology –University of Sao Paulo (Brazil), with doctoral internship–University of Coimbra (Portugal), focusing on Theatre and Performance Studies. Two undergraduation degrees: in Theatre and in Accounting–University of Sao Paulo.

Edgard Cornacchione is Full Professor at the University of Sao Paulo (USP, Brazil) and holds a Ph.D. in Accountancy from USP and a Ph.D. in Education from University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (USA). He has published many studies and books with a record of successful grant application and funded projects. He acts as editorial board member for journals in the United States, Europe and Latin America.

Silvia Pereira De Castro Casa Nova, PhD. is Full Professor at Universidade de Sao Paulo and visiting researcher at Université Laval. She is associate editor of Accounting Education, member of the RAE Scientific Editorial Board, serves as a peer reviewer in conferences and journals, and teaches since 1992. Her research areas are entrepreneurship, gender in higher education, and accounting education.

Abstract: This investigation intends to evaluate the aesthetic and pedagogic perspectives that guided the joint implementation of participatory budgeting programs and the Theatre of the Oppressed in Santo André during the years 1997 to 2008, which aimed to encourage public participation in the decision-making process of the city's investments. The specific objective of this study was to identify the aesthetic and pedagogic choices that guided a theatre project, which aimed to promote participation in the decision-making process public. The focus of this study is the findings of the sociologists Cecheti (2004) and Baiocchi (2006), where aesthetic experiences contribute to the promotion of participation in decision-making about resources. The methodology of the research was qualitative in nature (Maxwell, 1996), used a case study (Stake, 1995) and discourse analysis aided the evaluation of the collected material (Martins and Theóphilo, 2007). Interviews demonstrated that the Theatre of the Oppressed enabled the identification of participatory processes and alterity, which facilitated the population's ability to communicate its needs with greater expressiveness. Moreover, the results indicated that the Theatre of the Oppressed, while it had to adapt to the conditions of holding plenary meetings for participatory budgeting, allowed a modification in the symbolic representation of this space. It was possible to unravel the aesthetic and pedagogical aspects of the processes of the Theatre of the Oppressed in plenary budgeting sessions. In terms of budgetary education in particular, it appears possible to verify the theatre's intensely subjective and analytical nature.

Keywords: Theatre of the Oppressed; Participatory Budgeting; Accounting Education

1. Introduction

This study focuses on the findings of two sociologists, Cecheti (2004) and Baiocchi (2006), who argue that aesthetic experiences can contribute to the promotion of participation in processes of decision-making about resources. More specifically, it investigates the relationship between the programs of the Theatre of the Oppressed (TO) and participatory budgeting (PB) in the municipality of Santo André, Sao Paulo, from the late 1990s to 2000s. The authors were led to the understanding that the development of processes of educational theatre reconciled with public management enhances participation and the definition of the city's direction. Theatrical dynamics, when applied to resource management, differ from the traditional formats of budget meetings by motivating people's involvement through creativity and sensitivity, and thus expand communication channels between citizens and city hall. Baiocchi (op. cit.) calls this arrangement "governmental theatre", i.e., theatre as a participatory method of governance^①.

Participatory budgeting is an example of the practices carried out by several Brazilian municipalities, whose aim was to bring the population and political decisions closer together. The model came from projects of left-wing parties after the return of democracy to Brazil in the 1980s. The way the practices of PB developed in Santo André in association with the participatory theatrical processes of the OT has been a source of much study about issues of government in contemporary times. In fact, the exercise of participation on the stage and in the budget can be read as a phenomenon of participation in the context of political democracy. According to Baiocchi (2006), scenic experiences of a legislative and governmental character provide to the people possibilities of claiming priorities and manage the city through an artistic act.

According to Teixeira (2005), the formal channels of social participation are not always sufficient to detect the demands of the population, and the search for popular participation through new languages is therefore required. According to the author, the theatrical techniques created by Augusto Boal, a major figure of the TO, bring people of politics and the politics of the people together in an aesthetic project whose major milestone is participation.

In the case of theatrical interventions in PB meetings in Santo André, the purpose was to establish a playful and educational manner of debating the public accounts of the city. In line with opening up space for the participation of the population, the TO installed an alternative language that allowed greater understanding of conflicts and municipal needs. In addition to enabling the greater clarification of the issues of the agenda during budget meetings, interactions with the theatre instigated a process of reflection on personal and community conflicts beyond the public budget. The rapid multiplication of the TO through the city and the creation of several forum-theatre community groups (one of its techniques after 1998) were some of the developments of theatrical experiences that had been realised in the process of public budgeting.

Although participating in the TO's interventions suggests that people integrate with their collective and begin to act in the fight against oppression, the available information on the projects and experiences with the TO did not include a critical assessment of the purposes of the opening scene for spectators. Participation is usually a means of promoting dialogue and the possible risks of participating are not considered. Thus, there is a danger of an empty or ephemeral participation, a participation that does not lead to results, which is not extensive or is restricted to discourse, i.e., unrelated to the practice of participation itself. In an organisational context, for exam-

① In Cecheti (2004, p.101-102) the term government encompasses "besides the Mayor and his secretaries, all commissioned positions that have a political role and responsibility to implement certain political and administrative practices". For the purpose of this research, political government projects above all are considered, not only the government team addressed by Cecheti.

ple, Alcadipani and Almeida (2000) clearly present one of the risks of stimulating participation in their study of open offices, where they concluded that these lead to further costs and surveillance than traditional workspaces.

When it comes to participation in the government sphere the question becomes even more complex, as it also involves the management of the population's issues as a problem of the logic of biopolitics^①. Participation, in this context, takes the policy function of general maintenance of life through discourse, although in practice there is the policy of prioritisation of certain groups or needs. Given that the programs of the TO and PB in Santo André were operated by the municipal management's executive sphere, it is necessary to consider the conflict between the elected demands of the population and the program proposed by the government. In contrast to the approach of public government, whose characteristics and needs are delineated by problems of political power in contemporary society and whose agenda is defined by productivity measures of neoliberal economics, the organisation of a government agenda by Santo André's city hall would have to consider the proposed differences with respect to the priorities of the population raised during plenary PB meetings.

From the theatrical experiences reported by the director Augusto Boal (ABELLAN, 2001) from the Arena Theatre's stage in Sao Paulo (1950s and 1960s) to the systematisation of the TO (1970 until 2009, when he died), they noticed ways to improve techniques of dramaturgy. These techniques do not guarantee participation in artistic work or consider more relevant questions and needs, and are limited to stimulating the involvement of people. In fact, do theatre performances develop ways for viewers to participate in a story that does not identify (or is not relevant) to them, simply because they should have some participation? Similarly, one can move this question

to the spheres of other arts, education, media, politics and management.

It should be noted that in any case, the development of the TO in plenary meetings of participatory budgeting in Santo André, as understood by this reading, advocated aesthetics as a means of enhancing participation in decision-making for those who had historically been outside of the process. In this context, this work evaluates how art can help the public expression of those who were unrelated to decision-making, in the sense of ownership of management, education and art itself. Those who seek new aesthetic strategies to develop participation are not considered the most interested in this debate, but those who use new aesthetic strategies as an expressive means of gaining political participation are, because they have the desire, but were one excluded from this process.

However, according to Martins (2009, p.156), the municipality of Santo André (MSA) may have inserted the TO to strengthen its government project by promoting the idea of participation:

Just as inside the city hall there is an office that stimulates the criticality and prominence of subjects in order to use the instruments of social policy, the TO also ended up being a government instrument, legitimising the political leadership of those in power. Just as there was the possibility of potentiation for critical awareness aimed at empowering popular/citizen participation, it may be that this instrument was being used to legitimise, through the corroboration of Santo André's citizens, the government's top-down decisions. (Martins, 2009, p.156).

The paradox that introduces the possibility that participation may not lead to a sense of empowerment for the population, but merely the maintenance of government order, is reflected upon in the conclusions of Cecheti (2004) and Baiocchi (2006), with regard to the contributions of

① In the course taught by Michel Foucault at the Collège de France from January to April 1979, Foucault examines how life and the people have joined the political logic of liberal governmentality. (Foucault, 2008).

the theatre in the promotion of popular participation in the political process. Do aesthetics have conditions to this end? Would they be effective or sufficient? These questions are placed in the face of the difficulty in conceiving that the aesthetics of the TO could reverse the logic of contemporary participation to proceed, from the context of PB, to the conducting of debates about government priorities. Within the scope of forum theatre's dramaturgy, the model of participation would condition its own limitations, and the demands of the population, being constrained before for political reasons, may be restricted by the TO's imposition of spectator-intervention management.

Although there has been efforts by recent research in educational Administration and Accounting to highlight the benefits that the theatre can bring to Management and Sociology, including the indication of the effect of participatory theatre in government, investigations still lack enquiry as to whether the poetics of the theatre have had their full potential realised in these contexts. Reading these studies indicates that the format of the theatrical interventions in budgeting, where the spaces provided to the theatre were pre-defined in terms of technical or administrative boundaries, seems to waste the possibilities of theatrical communication by reducing the scenic event to a transmission of ideas and exhaustion of the public's interpretations. Furthermore, with regard to language resources used by the TO, the dramaturgy of the pieces seems to be limited to fixed dramatic forms with an overly illustrative scenic space.

This research did not aim to question the extent of the contribution of the theatre's aesthetics to budgetary participation in order to prove or disprove the effectiveness of the participation of citizens in public decision-making. This study is also not restricted to verifying the learning gains of the aesthetic formative processes of decision-making compared with traditional formative processes in the area of budgeting or to find new ways to stimulate the involvement of people in the decision-making

process who have resistance or no desire to participate.

Participation programs in public management seek political democratisation, as is the case for PB. However, to make use of theatrical dynamics as a means of facilitating involvement in the decision-making process, it is suggested that the theatre's aesthetic theatre is aligned to the purpose of governing the needs of a population. Since the conflict in place between the characters and the scenes are assumed by the audience in the forum to be objects of analysis, as well as guidance for attitudes and ideas, the theatre can take a pedagogical and moralising function that aims, as a premise of democratisation, to normalise budget priorities as well as the views and wishes of the population. The meaning that the philosopher Foucault gives to the government is: "to rule is the act of driving behaviours" (CASTRO, 2009, p.190).

This work intends to critique the use of theatre as a government strategy. On one side, research on the poetics of the Theatre of the Oppressed is configured in the domain of public management, whose theme of scenes and forums is participation in decision-making processes about municipal resources. On the other hand, the technique of forum theatre can suit the needs of discursive governmental participation. The main problem that arises is: how does the theatre allow the resizing of the participation process in its budget?

2. Literature review

We believe that there is, in what is called poetry, living forces, and that the image of a crime presented in appropriate theatrical conditions works for the spirit as something infinitely more fearsome than the crime itself. (ARTAUD, 2006, p.97).

The specific route of the relationship between the theatre and budgeting that occurred in public programmes of the TO and PB in Santo André has been studied in de-

tail by the authors Cecheti (2004) and Baiocchi (2006). The evaluation of the TO's intervention in Santo André's PB, from the methodological approach developed in the legislative theatre programmes in Rio de Janeiro, was performed by Boal (1997) and Baiocchi (op.cit.). The assumption that the theatre significantly contributes as an aesthetic alternative of participation when directing public funds seems to be instrumental in these studies. Of a sociological character, the first two show the theatre's potential as a means of communication in the dialogue of the public management process with the population, while Boal (op.cit.) presents a lucid account of the TO's interventions in PB in Santo André, written at the very time that the relationship was developed.

Cecheti's (1997) work on participation in the municipal management of Santo André from 1989 to 1992, a period prior to the inclusion of the TO programmes and PB, had already identified the importance of city hall-people negotiations for popular participation. In this regard, the elements of the forum and the exchange of city hall's technical knowledge with practical community know-how, already put forward the fertile field for the creation of the programmes of the TO and PB.

According to Cecheti (2004), the inclusion of the TO as a communicative management strategy encouraged public participation. However, it should be noted that the communicative sphere of this participation is related to the scope of government and should be considered within this context.

In the case of Santo André's municipality, a Public Participation Centre partnership (connected with the city hall) with the TO's centre in Rio de Janeiro aimed to train civil servants in their techniques. The Group of the Theatre of the Oppressed- Santo André (GTO- Santo André) was then created from the "challenge of being government and having to engage in dialogue with a wide and heterogeneous audience" (GTO-SANTO ANDRÉ, 2001, p. 24). It had the objective of being a theatre group that

could multiply the techniques and lead debates of a political nature to communities. According to Cecheti (op.cit., P.155), one of the key focuses of the GTO-Santo André was involvement with plenary PB meetings, "discussing what the public budget is, how it works, the political stances of people in this process, and contributing to the training of councillors of the government and civil society." About the benefits of using the TO in the PB process, it is "an appropriate instrument for transmitting, in a more educational and creative manner, all of the information that is necessary for the qualification of councillors, while making the training process less technical and investing in more ludic and interactive aspects"(Id., p.169).

In fact, TO's use of language was designed to facilitate a pedagogical understanding of public budgeting and public participation in this process:

The first sketch presented by the GTO was called, simply, "Participatory Budgeting", which worked elements of the PB process and made analogies between family budgeting and public budgeting. The play showed that, both in the family and city hall, there was a source of revenue and a series of expenses. In the family, the source of income is the salary of the father, mother or brothers. The costs come from needs and the family's standard of living. In the city hall, the source of revenue is municipal tax and expenditures include the demands of the population, the services that the city pays for and the municipal officials' salaries. (...) The play also showed that, just as in the family, there was a tendency for expenses to exceed revenues. It also showed that that [correct] usually triggered discussions and conflicts about what to do with money. Thus, for the father the priority was to buy a car, for the mother it was home improvement, for the son a video game, etc. As there were many demands and limited resources, it was necessary to know how to manage these resources well, which implies knowing how to prioritise. So, how does one set priorities? From there, the piece evolved to show that in Santo André there was a mechanism that carries out this discussion, but on a more general level it was the OP.

(Ibid., P.176).

One of the most discussed issues in the play presented in budget meetings was the different participation of men and women, since "many women suffer in order to freely put their claims forward independently of their husband's position." (Ibid., P.178). According to Carvalho and Ribeiro (2001), the interventions of the TO played a key role in promoting debates on women's participation in budget meetings. The authors state that the program also resulted in "encouraging women's participation during plenary sessions at the time of registration in order to speak, and in the nomination process for the Council." (Id. 2001, p.65).

Parts revolved around understanding the theme of population's participation in the budget process, while others specifically dealt with decisions about allocating public resources. During thematic plenary sessions, especially health and education, sketches dealt with issues relevant to these areas.

In 1997, a great event called the PB Carnival was held in which the GTO organised a samba school parade with the theme of PB and delivered a budgeting sketch to the municipal council at the end of the route. In a letter titled "Legislative Theatre Update" written to Richard Schechner in October 1997, Augusto Boal, Professor of Performance Studies at the University of New York, explained the development of the delivery of the budgeting sketch in Santo André and comments on the act's relationship with legislative theatre, one of the modalities of the so-called "Arsenal of the Oppressed Theatre".

According to Boal (1997), all of Santo André's PB sessions were of a deliberative character and started with a piece of forum theatre that presented a problem and invited the audience to find solutions. According to the author, the difference between this experience and that of

the Legislative Theatre of Rio de Janeiro was that, while in Santo André discussions were stimulated by pieces of theatre followed by traditional meetings, in Rio de Janeiro legal texts were produced in the theatre forum itself. However, Boal (Ibid, p.80, our translation) states that at the end of the PB process "the government collected all the suggestions and produced the city budget (by law, the budget must be submitted to the chamber before the last day of September)".

Although there never was a session with legislative theatre in the PB meetings of Santo André^①, Baiocchi (2006) develops the argument that meeting the PB councillors and performing a process of legislative theatre would have improved the process of budgetary distribution that made some of the law priorities. According to the author:

This connection between participation, individual and collective learning and social change is central to the practice of both PB and legislative theatre and refers to Freire's vision. Secondly, democratise access to power and challenge traditional conceptions of specialisation. Unlike liberal versions of government and participation, such as meetings with the city hall, PB and legislative theatre challenge the meaning of specialisation without, however, dismiss it. (Ibid., P.83, our translation).

It is understood, therefore, that despite being methodologically different, PB and legislative theatre have the common goal of popular participation in public management. Moreover, Baiocchi (ibid.) points out the significant features of these processes. The essential first is that PB is directly associated with the executive and the limited mandate of government. Legislative theatre deals with legislative power, i.e., it establishes laws that will be incorporated into a final policy instance. Another differentiating factor is that, while PB promotes high amounts of intense participation of the population in decision-making, leg-

^① In general the pieces were based exclusively on the form of forum theatre.

islative theatre allows political issues linked to a particular issue to be discussed in greater depth over time. The combination of the two strategies would have been a way to boost public participation through immediate and permanent processes, as well as combining the actions of the executive and legislative branches.

Baiocchi's observations about the possible realisation of legislative theatre in Santo André's PB sessions contribute to the understanding of the TO's general characteristics during budgeting, considering, in particular, the technique of forum theatre. However, with a focus more on action than law, forum theatre would practice a scene more as a study of intersubjective power between the characters and ways of intervening in power relations between individuals than studying the exercise of institutional power and ways of intervening in society. In any case, it is considered that both forum theatre and theatre legislative intended to treat the specificity of a problem or conflict. From a micro or macro perspective, the inclusion of the TO in PB was meant to contribute to risky new ways of confronting, resisting and conducting power in the meeting through sketches about conflict in the theatre.

In Santo André the TO programme conducted by MSA began in 1997 and came to an end in 2008. However, only from 1997 to 2001 were there theatrical interventions in the plenary PB sessions of the city. Referring to the period, Martins (2009, p.175) states that:

The TO's use of the language in debates about PB, construction of a sketch about budgets and its subsequent delivery to the mayor (...), seemed to bring more returns in relation to dialogue with the public than when it was tried in Celso Daniel's first term; back then, there was a more traditional dialogue that included lectures, seminars and meetings.

A text written by the members of the GTO-Santo André (2001, p.24) highlights the results of the TO's work in Santo André's PB meetings:

One of the advances observed in this process was the work of Santo André's GTO, which put the government in tune with an increasingly stronger dimension of contemporary life: the world of images and the growing concern about the playful activities. In other words, increasing social communication occurred through images and the aesthetic pleasure they provide.

It is considered that the evaluations undertaken in this research contribute to raising more detailed aspects of the TO's relationship with participatory budgeting, especially with regard to the critical issues of this project and contemporary questions about these types of methodologies.

3. Research Methodology

Because this research deals with historical processes, the qualitative analysis of phenomena does not aim for the generalisation of results. According to Maxwell (1996), qualitative evaluation derives from a perspective focused on people and situations where the emphasis is more on words than numbers.

In view of the objectives of this research, a case study strategy as developed by Stake (1995) was proposed. The case study is a qualitative evaluation strategy of phenomena observed in real situations. According to Martins and Theóphilo (2007), case studies make sense when it comes to an innovative treatment of problems from parts and procedures that surprise the scientific community, and when the in-depth analysis of a differential has not been exhausted. The application of a case study requires a protocol to be built on an already-followed path, even if during the execution a change of route occurs. From this perspective, research on the TO in the PB of Santo André was developed based on scripts and spreadsheets with information that cannot be forgotten.

The collection of field data was done through semi-structured interviews that had an oral history perspective, that is, a dialogue method involving the encouragement of

statements about experiences and the registration of conscious aspects of their speech and emotional expressions. Another source was the sketch “Participatory Budgeting” presented in budget meetings by the TO groups “Ondas da Rua” (composed of civil servants of Santo André) and “Nunca e Tarde”, a senior-aged community collective.

Interviews were conducted with servants, councillors and citizens, who in the presentations of the sketch “Participatory Budgeting” in the PB meetings of Santo André, assumed roles like wildcard characters, actors, observers or spectators. The objective was to interview a large number of people who had a working relationship with city hall and the TO program, as well as with councillors that represented the population on the participatory budget councils. The inclusion of the views of workers who were not from the theatre groups but were involved in PB is notable, as it contributed to the enrichment of analysis by presenting perceptions of those who was not directly linked to the programmes. Contact with a large number of spectators who only attended the PB plenary sessions was not possible, given the limitations of time and access. Note that there were no cases of councillors who played the roles of wildcard characters or actors in the TO and that citizens who played the role of actors are members of popular groups, such as “Nunca e Tarde”. In general, actors from popular groups were not wildcard characters from the TO. In turn, the role of the observer was defined as members of the GTO–Santo André who were not actors or wildcard characters at the time of the performance of “Participatory Budgeting”.

Table 1 below shows the amount of respondents, taking into consideration their relationship with city hall and PB and their function in the production of “Participatory Budgeting” by TO groups from “Ruas das Ondas” and “Nunca e Tarde”. Data collection was completed (interviews and survey documents) in a two-month period be-

tween 10/5/2010 and 13/7/2010.

An analysis of collected data was done in order to understand alignments and/or contradictions of respondents’ answers in relation to the studied theory as well as the materials raised. It intended to assess how involvement and articulation of people in relation to the public decision-making process unfolded during the implementation of programmes. The aim is to verify the aesthetic and pedagogical characteristics in scenes and interviews. Thus, there was the use of discourse analysis, a technique that allows the study of explicit and non-explicit intentions. The themes of the subjects were objects of analysis as well as the way they were presented. This technique allows discourse to be understood in the philosophical, political and ideological context in which it is produced, whilst considering that the enunciation of the subjects is guided by the perspectives of social groups to which they belong.

Table 1 Number of respondents and the relationship with city hall, PB and the TO

| Relation with city hall or PB | Role in the TO sketch “Participatory Budgeting” | Quantity |
|-------------------------------|---|----------|
| Worker | Wildcard | 3 |
| Worker | Actor | 3 |
| Worker | Observer | 2 |
| Worker | Spectator | 2 |
| Councillor | Spectator | 3 |
| Citizen | Actor | 1 |
| Citizen | Spectator | 1 |

4. Analysis of the collected material

In general, the resources used to operate the definition of the budget are of a technical^① nature and use a

① The basis for planning, execution and control of the budget depends on procedures of managerial accounting. It is common for the budget in organisations and even in public spheres to be the exclusive responsibility of managers and accountants.

specific language^①, and often facilitation strategies for communication procedures were resorted to as a means of ensuring access to budget related activities. The very space configuration in which decisions are made, and other factors such as conflict resolution, participation and power, constitute a centralising and organisational perspective of the budget process.

When it comes to participatory budgeting, the focus of the operation is not so much the handling of information but the debate about it. The decision itself is not so crucial, but the way it is generated is. The questioning of the events that will be prioritised creates another perspective of space and language in the budgeting process. The conflict is between two people from the population, and power is not exercised in hierarchical terms, but is spread among all.

The aspects of the budget process that can be enhanced will now be analysed, starting from the theatrical interventions. Specific characteristics of the PB in relation to the traditional budget process (public or organisational) shall assess how the theatre can contribute to a participatory perspective of the budgeting process.

Interviews with members of the groups “Ondas da Rua” and “Nunca e Tarde” as well as worker and participants who attended the plenary meeting performances of the sketch “Participatory Budgeting” intended to raise awareness of the TO’s aesthetic possibilities in the following elements of budgetary issues: (A) conflict resolution; (B) intervention in space; (C) perspective of numbers; (D) expression and speech; (E) participation and (F) exercise of power.

a. Resolution of conflicts

The fundamental theme of the budget is the allocation

of resources to different areas. Because it is a planning process in which applications are designed to be performed in a future period, the budget deals with the definition of objectives. Both in a participatory and a non-participatory approach budgeting is a conflict space, given that resources are limited while desires and expectations can be infinite.

The passage of a non-participatory budget compared to other participatory approaches leads to questions about the agreements to be established by the population. Is this a configuration that amplifies conflicts? Due to the large number of people involved in the PB process and the fact that debates with government members do not always lead to consensus in plenary sessions, is it possible to think that there is some conflict specificity in participatory decision-making processes?

According to the respondents, there was an event in Santo André’s PB meetings known as priority inversion, where the population sought to express a necessity for investment in a specific sector. In fact, there was not always agreement between the government and the councillors when voting occurred.

Study points to the importance of agreement among the participants in plenary meetings in order to generate a result from the group. At the same time, the pedagogical nature of the conflict was also stressed so as to enable the elaboration of space and expression of arguments. According to respondents, the TO enabled participants to expand views that promoted reflection on priorities and raise specific values of certain groups or regions of the city.

The role of theatrical interventions in the budget space to support the resolution of conflicts between priorities, the establishment of agreements in plenary sessions

① Accounting language is often laden with terminology that hinders users’ understanding. The study of Dias and Filho (2001) points to paths of improvement of the carrying apparatus from reflections on Communication Theory and Semiotics. Accounting as the language of business should consider aspects of information generation in order to make it more understandable for users. Inserting accessible terminology for the general public and reconciled to divulgation strategies, structure and socio-economic context, would ensure the relevance of accounting information to decision making. It is a resource for facilitating language as a pretext for understanding and using accounting information.

and the process of negotiation between the councillors is highlighted. According to a councillor, the TO could have been more effective if it were introduced, not only at the beginning of the PB cycle, but in the "middle ground", that is, during stages of discussion and preparation of the budget by government and councillors. Although the function of the TO was not clear for all respondents, when it came to conflicts during participatory budgeting, all seemed to consider that the TO's involvement in the process led to a more favourable performance in dialogue processes.

b. Intervention in space

One of features of the relationship between actors and spectators in forum theatre is the spatiality. In this mode, it is possible to boost the occupation of the scenic space in a way that integrates people from the audience, unlike a play in which there is no forum. In PB, space is constituted in such a way that the manifestation of claims and statements from government members are possible.

In general, people in the audience were organised in a queue to speak into the microphone that faced a table composed of government representatives, who had the opportunity to comment on the demands of the population. The coordinating team that processes claims and registers participants generally kept to the sides, only mediating the audience-table relationship. The plenary meetings would have 400 people of average, but this would reached 1,000 people on some occasions^①. Plenary meetings were held in various places, from schools or regional associations with the MSA, and the process was conducted in courtyards, auditoriums, stages, football courts or classrooms.

The performances of the sketch "Participatory Budgeting" happened before the start of the plenary sessions in Santo André, where the space used was practically the same. Once the forum ended, the coordinating team removed props used for the scenery of the GTO-Santo An-

dré and assembled a government table (or moved it when it was already there). Despite the removal of the table for the sketch's performance, one respondent considered that although there had been contributions from the theatre, it was still not possible to demystify the table as a central reference point of the process. In a general way, the interviewee stated that the theatre was not enough to change the structure of the plenary meetings and included difficulties such as visibility and audibility of the scenes.

The adaptive content pointed to by respondents suggests that there was little opportunity for the TO to intervene in the logic of the space. In this sense, the shared primary concern for respondents was: do theatrical performances in budgetary decision space modify the relationship that people have with this space? Nevertheless, some respondents felt that the contribution of the TO as an intervention within PB meetings mainly occurred in terms of symbolic representation, not physical reconfiguration.

c. Perspective of numbers

For people who were beginning to participate in the plenary meetings, the approach of the discussion about numbers could have been somewhat abstract. The difficulty could also have been the fact that the numbers were very high and lacked reality for participants, which possibly harmed the decisions. ^[Check 1]According to one interviewee, however, the greatest difficulty was not the conflict of values but technically, as the execution of the budget and names of some taxes have encrypted technical language.

We also asked respondents if the TO's performances contributed to the representation of numbers in a different way, making them more concrete and similar to everyday life, or else bring a symbolic dimension to it. Another interviewee explained that the focus of working with the TO in PB was not numbers, but priorities. According to the respondent, in general, the value of numbers could not have managed to make the manifestation of the popula-

① Leased iron chairs (bar-chair bar) were placed side by side in front of the table.

tion's demands possible, and not even the presentation of programs by the government and the GTO-Santo André had defined roles around prioritising values.

Although there was the scaling of priority values, the sketch did not touch on some important issues of the PB process, such as the notion of a little and a lot, proportions and percentages. The role of the TO was considered introductory on this query and did not cover the needs of the subsequent stages of the PB meetings and caused a little estrangement ^[Check] with numbers and the process of assigning values.

d. Expressiveness and orality

According to one respondent, the TO proposed a change in the way people spoke at the PB plenary meetings in the sense that the theatre was an invitation for people to express themselves more freely and less coldly, without the need of having to express militant-like formal language.

Inhibition when people exposed themselves to a large audience could have made many people unwilling to demand their needs during plenary meetings. Nevertheless, the prior performance of the TO seemed to help encourage people to voice their concerns. Some respondents pointed to the fact that with the theatre's approach, unlike the political and budgetary context in general, women felt the will to participate, express their demands and reflect on decision-making.

It is considered that the participatory environment of the budget meetings gave the population more opportunities to develop communication with each other as well as with the government. The contribution of the TO in this sense is, besides presenting a reference from another point of view, it opened up the possibility of expressiveness in claims.

e. Participation

At first, the approach appeared to be favourable, involving people who had no connection with politics. However, a more critical evaluation of the respondents' views

on participation indicates the need to consider the deadlocks that existed because of the differences between regions and finite resources for investment. Another crucial factor to consider about participation in the PB is the progress of the population's demands, especially with regard to the role of the population in truly occupying the space opened by the government.

In relation to the role of the TO, the theme of participation seems to have been essential to its achievement in the specific context of Santo André. The factors raised were: pedagogical content, socialisation, understanding of the budgeting process and playfulness.

There were limits to the participation process: it was not always possible to provide that which the people had hoped for. It was considered, however, that the TO attempted to show that there are different ways to get involved in the budgeting process and that failure to not meet demands was no reason to demobilise community groups.

f. Power exercises

Possible disputes between the movements that attended the plenary meetings drew attention (above all) to the relationship that was established between the groups that attended the PB plenary meetings, that is, without considering government mediation. One question that arises relates to the representativeness of the population. Representatives in general were linked to housing, education and women movements and the meetings faced the dilemma of having to drive these themes whilst including other aspects of civil society.

According to some respondents, the involvement trajectory of some of the participants elected by the community to represent them during the municipal council's PB meeting gave an understanding that the process was a kind of political ascension. Some leaders had become councillors. The TO, within this context of representation, seemed to give prominence to those who were on the scene. In a way, the theatre ended up contributing to the

formation of movement leaders.

While the theatre specifically directed the plenary meetings at those who were not involved in politics, it was not a full space for involvement of those who were more part of the political process. While the leaders focused on articulation, the people watched the theatre (which also posited itself as participative), but the focus was not on already-experienced people and movement in the participation.

Conclusion

The survey of studies on participatory budgeting has allowed their theoretical and methodological aspects to be addressed. The benefits promoted by PB were political decentralisation, the improvement of state-society relations and the promotion of pedagogic processes in political participation, in addition to presenting a brief historical/geographical overview of other experiences with the TO. The context for the implementation of this programme in Santo André was then established with factual information. From there, we could refer to the conjunction of the TO with PB, which considered reviews of previous studies on the case of Santo André. Certain descriptions about the performances of the sketches in the regional plenary meetings and the thematics of PB in Santo André stood out as being beyond their political and pedagogical principles. The intention of participation was then scored as the axis of the relationship between PB and the Theatre of the Oppressed.

The analysis was done along with interviews about the theatre's contribution to the budgeting process of Santo André city, and views were raised about aspects that related to the themes: conflict resolution, intervention in space, perspective of numbers, expressiveness and orality, participation and the exercise of power. We conclude that (a) the TO enabled the improvement of dialogue between the population and the government, but did not allow for the achievement of agreements through conflict

resolution; (B) the Theatre of the Oppressed, while they had to adapt to the conditions of holding local PB plenary meetings, they enabled a change in the symbolic representation of this space; (C) the TO did not include a more extensive process of questioning the numbers, especially in regards to the training of advisers, while making it possible for the plenary discussions to demarcate less in numerical values than priority values; (D) the TO enabled the process of identification and alterity that led to the facilitation of the population's ability to communicate its needs with greater expressivity; (E) by focusing on the first stage of the PB cycle, the TO did not enable the realisation of demands and, despite their pedagogical intentions for participation and encouragement of social movements, they seemed to have promoted, in some way, the illusion that the budget would incorporate all desires; and (f) the TO could have given space for the promotion of people with special interests, operating contrary to the theme and discourse of the sketch "Participatory Budgeting".

When the TO, in the context of participatory budgeting, was not marked by the theme of participation, the achievement of results on the budget seemed to have been greater. After the sketch "Participatory Budgeting" was no longer performed in the plenary meetings, there was a focus on theatre work with communities. In this step, the TO started to have a bias to this artistic process and allowed, with its extensive nature, a deepening in terms of understanding and transformation of the issues for the community itself.

In this research it was possible to unravel the aesthetic and pedagogical aspects in the processes of the Theatre of the Oppressed in plenary PB meetings. In terms of the budgetary teachings in particular, it appears possible to verify the theatre's intensely subjective and analytical nature. Thus, pedagogic processes in Accounting (where the subject is the budget, public or management), especially when it comes from a perspective that aims at participation, count on political aspects of

participatory budgeting and the methodology of the Theatre of the Oppressed in order to consider more subjective, rather than formal, aspects.

A limitation of the study was the fact that it dealt with the investigative route more from the standpoint of procedures than the demands of the population itself. Other research that assesses the budgetary contributions provided by the theatrical approach can deepen the discussion on the demands and priorities of the population that probably today are no longer the same. Accountants and Accounting educators benefit from reflections here by being exposed to the consideration that theatre brings a plethora of perspectives to the learning process, but can,

at the same time, be an overwhelming precision. It is understood that theatrical practices can be tested in other organisational contexts and also specifically when teaching the budgets of schools and taking precautions in these transfers. At the same time, there is the possibility of making theatre of Accounting, a domain whose narratives can expand on an excessively technical and rational approach. Public managers and people interested in participatory budgeting, in order to identify with the problems of participation presented in this research, can search for languages and alternative poetics for traditionally dry and technical processes like budgeting.

References

- [1] Abellan, Joan. Boal conta Boal. Barcelona: Institut del Teatre Diputació de Barcelona, 2001.
- [2] Alcadipani, Rafael. Almeida, Aline. Por fora bela viola, por dentro...: Análise Crítica sobre a Gestão do Espaço nas Organizações através de um Estudo de Caso sobre a Implementação de um Escritório aberto no Brasil. Organizações e Sociedade, v.7, n.19, Salvador: setembro / dezembro, 2000.
- [3] Artaud, Antonin. O Teatro e seu Duplo. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2006.
- [4] Baiocchi, Gianpaolo. Performing democracy in the streets: Participatory Budgeting and Legislative Theatre in Brazil. In: Cohen-Cruz, Jan. Schutzman, Mady. A Boal Companion: Dialogues on theatre and cultural politics. London, New York: Routledge, 2006.
- [5] Boal, Augusto. Legislative Theatre Update. Rio de Janeiro, October, 1997. In: SCHECHNER, Richard. CHATTERJEE, Sudipto. Augusto Boal, City Councillor: Legislative Theatre and the Chamber in the Streets: An Interview. The Drama Review, Winter, v. 42, n.4. New York: 1998.
- [6] Carvalho, Maria do Carmo A. Ribeiro, Matilde. Gênero e raça nas políticas públicas: experiências em Santo André – SP. São Paulo: Pólis, 2001.
- [7] Castro, Edgardo. Vocabulário de Foucault: Um percurso pelos seus temas, conceitos e autores. Belo Horizonte: Autêntica, 2009.
- [8] Cecheti, Osvaldo Cleber. As novas linguagens de participação na gestão pública: a experiência do Teatro do Oprimido na Prefeitura de Santo André. Tese (Doutorado em Ciências Sociais). São Paulo: Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, 2004.
- [9] A Dimensão Político-Pedagógica da Participação Popular. Um estudo sobre a participação popular na gestão municipal de Santo André (1989–1992). Dissertação (Mestrado em Ciências Sociais). São Paulo: Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, 1997.
- [10] Dias Filho, José Maria. Características Qualitativas da Informação Contábil: O problema da Compreensibilidade à luz da Teoria Semiótica e da Comunicação. Tese (Mestrado em Controladoria e Contabilidade). São Paulo: Universidade de São Paulo, 2001.
- [11] Foucault, Michel. Nascimento da Biopolítica. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008.
- [12] Godoi, Christiane Kleinübing. Mattos, Pedro Lincoln C. L. de. Entrevista qualitativa: instrumento de pesquisa e evento di-

- alógico. In: Pesquisa Qualitativa em Estudos Organizacionais: Paradigmas, Estratégias e Métodos. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2006.
- [13] Gto-Santo André. A Experiência do GTO como Método de Participação Popular na Administração Pública. In: Metaxis: A Revista do Teatro do Oprimido. n.1. Rio de Janeiro: Centro de Teatro do Oprimido do Rio de Janeiro, 2001.
- [14] Martins, Gilberto de Andrade. Theóphilo, Carlos Renato. Metodologia da investigação científica para ciências sociais aplicadas. São Paulo: Atlas, 2007.
- [15] Martins, Janaina Bilate. Teatro do Oprimido: a experiência de Santo André/SP. Tese (Doutorado em Serviço Social). São Paulo: Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, 2009.
- [16] Maxwell, Joseph A. Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 1996.
- [17] Stake, Robert E. The Art of Case Study Research. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 1995.
- [18] Teixeira, Tania Múrcia Baraúna. Dimensões Sócio Educativas do Teatro do Oprimido de Augusto Boal. Revista Recrearte. Espanha: [s.n.], v. 4, 2005.

(Editor-in-charge: Huang Hai)

公共预算中的教育干预和戏剧诗学的贡献

[巴西]多迪·塔瓦列斯·李尔¹, [巴西]小埃德加·布鲁诺·科纳钦恩²,
[巴西]西尔维亚·佩雷拉·德卡斯特罗·卡萨诺瓦²
(1.南巴伊亚联邦大学; 2.圣保罗大学)

内容摘要: 1997年至2008年间圣安德烈指导了旨在鼓励公共参与城市投资决策过程的项目, 该项目将预算项目的参与实施和“受压迫者的戏剧”相结合。本研究意图评估其美学和教育观点, 研究的具体目标是明确在指导戏剧项目时在美学和教育方向上的选择, 其目的是为了促进决策过程中的公共参与。社会学家 Cecheti(2004)和 Baiocchi(2006)关于美学体验有助于促进参与决策的研究成果是本研究的主要关注点。研究方法主要采用了定性研究 (Maxwell, 1996), 案例研究 (Stake, 1995), 以及辅助评估所收集到的材料的话语分析 (Martins and Theophilo, 2007)。一些访谈表明“受压迫者的戏剧”有助于参与过程中的认同和相异性表达, 这样就有助于提升公众在与更有力的意见表达相沟通时表达他们需求的能力。此外, 结果表明尽管“受压迫者的戏剧”不得不适应参与预算决策的全体会议的条件, 不过这个空间的象征性代表是允许作出修改的。这也揭示了“受压迫者的戏剧”在整体的预算会议期间所呈现出的美学和教育学面貌。尤其值得注意的是戏剧强烈的主观性和分析性体现在预算教育的过程中。

关键词: 被压迫者的戏剧; 参与式预算; 会计教育